



Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

ANNUAL OPEN FORUM MEETING 20 OCTOBER 2022: 1430 - 1630 RADISSON BLU EDWARDIAN HEATHROW

Present:

Julia Ainsby	Richmond Sea Cadets
Paul Atkin	CISHA NED
Robert Barnstone	Stop Heathrow Expansion
Justine Bayley	Chair of Stop Heathrow Expansion and Harmondsworth resident
Paul Beckford	HACAN
Puja Bedi	Councillor for Colnbrook with Poyle ward; Slough Borough Council
Bridget Bell	PHASE (Plane Hell Action South East London)
Nick Biskinis	Chair, Clapham Transport Users Group
David Blunkett	Chair of Heathrow Local Recovery Forum
John Bowden	Councillor for Royal Borough of Windsor & Maidenhead
Robert Buick	Englefield Green Action Group
Stephen Clark	Teddington Action Group
Rebecca Cox	CISHA Secretariat
Kathleen Croft	Past Chair of Stanwell Moor Residents Association
Katherine Dunne	Councillor London Borough of Hounslow
Shafick Emmambokus	Supporter of Back Heathrow
Mark Frost	Heathrow Strategic Planning Group
Hylton Garriock	Deputy Chair of Longford Residents Association
Hannah George	HAL (Community Engagement Manager)
Dr Roger Green	Chair of Heathrow Local Community Forum
John Gurney	Civil aviation transport, Unite the Union
Andrew Hall	Local resident
Mine Hitzi	HAL (Chief Lawyer)
John Holland-Kaye	HAL (CEO)
James Holmes	HAL (Head of Local Strategic Engagement)
Martyn Hurst	PSG member and former technical advisor to HCEB
Mark Izatt	CISHA NED & PSG Chair
Danielle Knafo	HAL (Stakeholder Engagement Manager)
Andy Knight	HAL (Community Engagement)
Andreas Lambrianou	Chair of Heathrow Community Noise & Airspace Forum
John Lees	Iver Village Residents Association
Margaret Majumdar	Ealing Aircraft Noise Action Group
Wendy Matthews	Buckinghamshire Council
Elaine Mells	Pavilion Association (south side resident)
Nigel Mells	Pavillion Association (south side resident)



Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

Nigel Milton	HAL (Chief of Staff)
Barry Nelson-West	Local Councillor LB Hillingdon; Back Heathrow Voluntary Activist
Gerry O'Connell	Local resident
Heather Pennock	ABTA and PSG member
Rupert Penny	Back Heathrow / West London resident
Deborah Petty	NACF Member representing Elmbridge & Molesey Residents Assoc.
Stuart Pick	London Chamber of Commerce & Industry (LCCI)
Sarah-Jane Pickthorne	HAL (Community Engagement Co-ordinator)
Matt Prescott	Chair of Air Quality Working Group and HAL Head of Carbon
Nikaesh Rattan	Back Heathrow Activist; Friend of Heathrow Academy
Phil Rumsey	HASRA; The friends of The great Barn at Harmondsworth
Veronica Rumsey	Harmondsworth Village Allotments
Jags Sanghera	Our Southall, Southall Community Alliance
Val Shawcross	Chair of Heathrow Area Transport Forum
Liz Sugg	CISHA Chair
Jack Sosnierz	Working in aviation in airports and airlines environment
Neil Spurrier	Member of the Teddington Action Group
Eilish Stone	Local resident
James Swindlehurst	Leader Slough Borough Council
Jane Taylor	Harmondsworth and Sipson Residents Association
Armelle Thomas	HASRA
Chris Turrell	Bracknell Forest Council
Neil Wallace	Back Heathrow
Catherine Ward	DWP / JCP
Peter Willan	Chair of Richmond Heathrow Campaign
Guy Williams	Back Heathrow
Graham Young	Richings Park Residents Association

1. Introduction from Baroness Sugg, CISHA Chair

The Chair welcomed everyone to the meeting before outlining the role and remit of CISHA. CISHA would develop a joined-up approach to stakeholder engagement, coordinating and promoting dialogue between the engagement forums within the new structure. Key issues would be identified and solutions agreed and action taken where possible, using the [escalation process](#). In line with CISHA's commitment to transparency, where no solution could be identified this would be explained. CISHA would be making formal, published recommendations to HAL, the responses to which would also be published. Whilst CISHA, like all Airport Consultative Committees, was funded by the airport, it retained absolute independence in determining how the funding should be spent and in setting its own work programme and objectives. CISHA will be working to ensure genuine and inclusive engagement and consultation, maximising the involvement of all stakeholders.



Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

2. Updates from the forum chairs

- **Dr Roger Green, Chair, Local Community Forum**

The format and membership of the forum was explained and the plans to develop it to increase the diversity of membership and ensure that its work was open, transparent, meaningful, and solution-focused were outlined. With the new independent chairs working within the CISHA structure, it was felt they would be able to work together effectively to ensure that Heathrow Airport became a better neighbour.

- **Lord David Blunkett, Chair, Heathrow Local Recovery Forum**

Lord Blunkett summarised the history of the forum and how it had expanded beyond employment and skills to focus on wider economic regeneration with outreach into a broader geographical area. Previous work included securing the London living wage, improving access for those with learning difficulties, and the reshaping of the Heathrow Academy. The Local Recovery Forum would welcome the opportunity to work with other forums in areas where there was overlap.

- **Val Shawcross, Chair, Heathrow Area Transport Forum**

Val highlighted how the DfT required airports to have such a committee and outlined its membership and key areas of its work programme. In addition to regular meetings, larger themed forums were held every six months to enable a wider range of interested stakeholders get involved. HATF published an annual report and those present were encouraged to visit its [website](#) for more information. The positive development of having a closer, coordinated group of Forums to interact with Heathrow under the new structure was emphasised.

- **Andreas Lambrianou, Chair, Noise & Airspace Community Forum**

The membership of the forum was currently quite wide, but Andreas was aiming to strengthen and broaden its reach to include those who traditionally did not have a voice and to increase geographical representativeness. The focus was on noise as both a nuisance and as having a negative impact on health. Key recurring themes included airspace modernisation, night flights, the airport's noise action plan, PBN and runway alternation. He would be having one-to-one meetings with all members prior to its next meeting.

- **Matt Prescott, Chair, Heathrow Air Quality Working Group**

Matt had just taken on the role and was the only chair within the new structure who was a HAL employee. Members of the group were being encouraged to put forward an alternative chair who would be independent. The group played a key role in reviewing the monitoring data and research into air quality. It was recognised that members of the Local Community Forum would share concerns about air quality and that it would be key for the two to work together, and also with CISHA whose remit included monitoring Heathrow 2.0.



Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

- **Mark Izatt, Chair, Passenger Services Group**

The PSG was constituted of representatives from professional bodies and independent regular travellers and worked alongside HAL to monitor the passenger experience. In its first in-person meeting post-pandemic it had focused on the data behind the passenger cap and the picture illustrated by the metrics before and after it was introduced. Anyone was able to flag a passenger related issue by contacting the PSG through the CISHA [website](#).

The Chair thanked each for their contribution, stressing that there were clearly many strands of work, which CISHA would bring together to create a more effective and impactful approach to drive forward action.

3. Open Q&A with Baroness Sugg and the forum chairs

A number of questions were asked, and issues raised, including:

- *Does CISHA have any teeth?*

While as an ACC it had a statutory duty to ensure effective stakeholder engagement and consultation, it does not have any method to force change. However, it had an independent voice, with the ability to make public formal recommendations requiring a response and to work with other organisations such as the DfT and CAA. The Chair would be raising this issue with John Holland-Kaye later in the meeting.

- *Could the contact details of the forum chairs be made available?*

The CISHA website would be developed to provide clear, concise, and transparent information on each of the forums. In the meantime, the email addresses for each would be circulated with the meeting notes. **ACTION: Rebecca**

- *Could HATF play a role in encouraging TfL to improve signposting, and also work towards pushing through Southern Rail access?*

Whilst HATF was a strategic body, it could be used to flag issues such as signage, which was known to be a problem on some routes. Any such suggestions should be submitted via the HATF [website](#) and would be passed on appropriately – in this instance to HAL's surface access team. HATF was currently engaged in the Southern Rail access work and was feeding in ideas about the ideal route for this.

- *Could the Air Quality Working Group play more of an active role in looking into identifying which ultra-fine particles come from aircraft and which come from vehicles?*

The Group had sponsored a PhD in this area and was working with other airports to identify what research was required to develop actionable data. Real time data from monitoring stations can be found at [here](#). A number of studies had been carried out on

Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

ultra-fine particles in the past and the chair would put together a summary of these, including those related to their presence in enclosed spaces. **ACTION: Matt Prescott**

- *Was any work being carried out to address the plans proposed when terminal 5 was built that have yet to happen, such as cycle ways and bus routes?*
HATF was aware of this and the historical political issues that had delayed these. With the development of the Heathrow Strategic Planning Group, cooperation between the different local authorities and the airport was getting better. It was hoped that this improved collaboration would assist in moving these plans forward.
- *The issue of securing adequate refunds for flights cancelled because of the introduction of the passenger cap was raised.*
The responsibility for refunds sits with airlines, but PSG would continue to work with industry on the passenger cap and its implications, and any comments could be fed into them via the CISHA [website](#).

4. John Holland-Kaye in conversation with Baroness Sugg

- **Expectations of and commitment to CISHA**
The airport was an integral part of the community, with both a negative impact in terms of air quality, noise, and traffic congestion, and a positive one in terms of employment, training and supporting local schools and businesses. CISHA had been structured to reflect this, to align the work of the various forums and identify opportunities for delivering material change. In developing a common plan, facilitating dialogue, and focusing on areas in which it could make a difference, CISHA could help the airport become a better neighbour. John Holland-Kaye (JHK) gave assurances that both he and the management team were committed to working alongside CISHA, as the forum structure was directly related to the work of the airport. Issues prioritised by CISHA would be incorporated into the Heathrow 2.0 work plan.
- **Expansion**
JHK explained that whilst the airport had paused the DCO process during the pandemic, the Airports National Policy Statement (ANPS) remained valid. HAL remains committed to expansion, as JHK said the UK would need a strong hub airport and COVID had highlighted the economic co-dependency between West London and the airport. When pressed for further clarity on the timeline due to the negative impact of the persistent uncertainty on the lives of local residents, it was confirmed that a small team was currently looking at expansion and a statement would be issued in January 2023. JHK recognised that this would not alleviate the uncertainty and appreciated that the programmes in place to try to address the effects of this did not meet everyone's needs. As soon as certainty could be provided, it would be.



Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

- **Government imposed ATM cap**

John Holland-Kaye stated that HAL were not actively pursuing an increase in this as a two-runway airport and there were no specific plans to do so.

- **Noise**

It had been promised that future airspace change would result in some improvements in the problem of noise, and clarification was sought on when consultation on the proposed flight paths would be. JHK said the airspace change process was set out by the CAA and was extremely complicated. HAL's application was currently at stage 2 of 7 stages. It was recognised that flight paths would be the most meaningful issue for stakeholders, and it was anticipated that consultation on this would not take place until 2024 at the earliest. CISHA would have input into the consultation process, and into any relevant issues that could be looked at prior to then.

- **Night flights**

A regular complaint from local residents was that the problem of late and early running flights had worsened since the pandemic, and that there was not always adequate information available on why this was the happening. John Holland-Kaye monitored the data every morning and recognised that in recovery there had been too many late running flights, for a variety of reasons. One of the reasons for introducing the passenger cap had been to reduce these and numbers had come down significantly since mid-July. Due to the impact of the pandemic, the airport had not been able to achieve its aim of halving the number of late running flights by 2021/22, but remained committed to the reduction, with the aim of being in the position where the only incidences had legitimate reasons for their occurrence. Daily operational data can be found on the airport's [website](#) and is updated monthly.

5. Open Q&A with John-Holland-Kaye

The session included both questions submitted in advance and those resulting from today's discussions:

- *Has HAL any plans to provide hoists in airport toilets or to encourage airport hotels to install them in their bathrooms?*

Whilst the airport worked hard to ensure that the standard of service provided to the most vulnerable passengers was as high as it could be, it was recognised that it was not where it should be with special equipment. New showers had been introduced for use prior to passing through immigration and security in departures and arrivals, but more work was required. John Holland-Kaye suggested that a representative from the [Heathrow Access Advisory Group](#) should sit on CISHA and CISHA would follow the issue

Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

up with the Heathrow Hoteliers Association with whom the questioner had already raised it.

ACTION: CISHA

- *Is the economic case for expansion still justifiable in the light of other European airports cancelling their expansion plans, and can the contracts of the independent forum chairs be extended to ensure consistency?*

HAL believed that the economic case for expansion was still there, and suggested it had become stronger post-Brexit when the major trade benefits of having a hub airport had been demonstrated, as had the need for connectivity. CISHA would be involved in assessing the economic case should the DCO process be resumed. It was confirmed that HAL was committed to ensuring that the chairs had adequate resources to carry out their roles effectively. Nigel Milton, HAL Chief of Staff, agreed to talk to the CISHA Chair and the other forum chairs about their contracts.

ACTION: CISHA/Nigel Milton

- *At the HCEB event on 3 October 2019 attended by the Vienna Dialogforum, there was clear agreement that engagement and consultation by the airport should be better than the legal minimum. Is this possible for CISHA to achieve when funded directly by HAL and could it instead be funded, like Vienna, through a passenger duty?*

Currently, under DfT guidelines, there is no provision for ACCs to be funded by anyone other than the airports. The DfT would not provide funding and such a duty could not be introduced by a single airport alone. In response to the question, CISHA would raise the issue with [UKACCS](#), the umbrella organisation for ACCs, and with the DfT. The need for consistent levels of funding was recognised by HAL, and CISHA remained committed to ensuring that any consultation by the airport exceeded the legal minimum.

- *Could more work be done to incentivise people to cycle and make cycling the first choice, for example by working with developers to ensure cycle connectivity was built into all new developments?*

It was agreed that this was an excellent suggestion and one which could be taken forward. Val Shawcross reported that work was being carried out to develop a more integrated approach but that a publicly driven, large area-based regeneration project was required around the airport to drive the introduction of such measures, including better connectivity between public transport modes. Other schemes had been introduced aiming to reduce the number of people driving, such as securing heavily discounted fares on the Elizabeth Line for HAL colleagues.

ACTION: HATF

- *In the interest of transparency, could there be links to the other forums on the CISHA website and could the process on stepping up as a potential chair of the Air Quality Working Group be outlined?*

The Chair confirmed there were plans to develop dedicated pages for each of the forums on the CISHA website, which will include details of this process.

ACTION: CISHA

Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport

- When will the free travel zone suspended during COVID be reintroduced?*
 HATF had established a working group to look at this. The free travel zone would not be reinstated as a whole. Instead it would be done piecemeal, in a targeted way, prioritising the most effective routes.
- HAL have been told that they cannot have a third runway. When will they listen?*
 John Holland-Kaye confirmed that as long as the ANPS remained valid the airport would continue to act within it.
- Where do communities come in HAL's priorities in relation to airlines and shareholders, for example steep approaches versus noise relief? Is it possible to prioritise the needs of the community over business?*
 The job of both the HAL CEO and CISHA was to identify and analyse potential trade-offs. Noise was the most complex issue, but over the past year local communities had been working together cooperatively to agree about the sharing of noise, recognising that there are benefits and disbenefits associated with living near the airport. The airspace change consultation in 2024 would give people an opportunity to have their voices heard about issues such as respite and predictability, making suggestions that could influence the design process.
- Does Heathrow Airport accept that its hours of operation are 0415 to 1130, not 0600 to 1100 as stated in the literature? Could the literature be amended to be honest about this?*
 John Holland-Kaye accepted that, because of early arrivals, this was the case. The Chair of the Noise & Airspace Community Forum would take this away and meet Bridget Bell to discuss the issue further. **ACTION: ANDREAS LAMBRIANOU**
- What assurances can HAL give that they will not replicate the mistakes happening in the United States?*
 The consultation process would be designed, with the input of CISHA, to ensure that every implication of a proposed airspace change would be identified.
- Would HAL be prepared to restrict passenger growth to achieve net zero?*
 HAL did not accept that demand management was a solution as it simply displaced the problem. It preferred instead to focus on new technologies, which it believed to be a quicker, more effective route. For example, more sustainable aviation fuel was uploaded at Heathrow this year than at any other airport.

The meeting concluded with the Chair thanking everyone for attending and confirming a summary and action points would be circulated and posted on the CISHA website.