



Council for the Independent Scrutiny of Heathrow Airport Quarterly Meeting
Thursday 20th April 2023, 1330 - 1530
Heathrow Academy, Newall Rd, Hounslow, TW6 2AP

Present:

Forum chairs

Liz Sugg	Chair, CISHA
David Blunkett	Chair, Local Recovery Forum
Roger Green	Chair, Local Community Forum
Mark Izatt	Chair, Heathrow Passenger Forum
Andreas Lambrianou	Chair, Noise and Airspace Community Forum
Matt Prescott	Chair, Air Quality Working Group (HAL)

Local authority representatives

CLlr Katherine Dunne	London Borough of Hounslow
CLlr Ian Edwards	London Borough of Hillingdon
CLlr Matt Furniss	Surrey County Council
CLlr John Martin	London Borough of Ealing
CLlr James Swindlehurst	Slough Borough Council

External

Helen Dolphin	Heathrow Access Advisory Group (HAAG)
Mark Frost	Heathrow Strategic Planning Group
Wayne Gasson	DfT
Tim Lawson	DfT
Stuart Lindsey	Civil Aviation Authority
Adam Tyndall	Business London
Nigel Wicking	Heathrow AOC Ltd

HAL

John Holland-Kaye	(joined for the last 30 minutes)
Becky Coffin	
Danielle Knapo	
James Holmes	
Nigel Milton	
Rick Norman	

Meeting notes

Rebecca Cox	CISHA Secretariat
-------------	-------------------

Apologies:

CLlr Andrew Johnson	Royal Borough of Windsor and Maidenhead
Val Shawcross	Chair, Heathrow Area Transport Forum



1. Chair's introduction, previous meeting notes, outstanding actions

- The Chair welcomed all to the meeting, noted apologies and reviewed the action points from the previous meeting. As previously, papers had been circulated in advance and would be taken as read to maximise the time available to discuss the issues raised.
- The notes of the meeting held on 2nd February 2023 were approved and apologies noted.
- **Agreed actions:**
 - The NACF mapping exercise was complete and would be circulated with the meeting notes.
 - The HAQWG work plan had been agreed and would be published on the CISHA website.

2. Heathrow Airport operational update from Nigel Milton

- Passenger numbers continued to grow towards pre-Covid levels, with figures for March at 90% of 2019. However, the passenger mix had altered. Business travel remained lower, with more families; older people; and those with less experience of flying through Heathrow now using the airport, which had resulted in some operational challenges.
- The Easter peak had not presented any significant problems and there had been greater collaboration between HAL, the airlines, NATS and ground-handlers. The strike action at this time had been managed by spreading the impact around the campus, which enabled operations to continue smoothly, although it was recognised that the passenger experience was not always optimum as a result.
- Further strikes were planned for May, as the most recent pay offer had not been accepted, and contingencies were already in place to minimise any potential disruption.

3. HAL Quarterly Report to CISHA: format feedback

- The new HAL quarterly report would be included in the meeting pack sent round in advance of each quarterly meeting. The first had been circulated and feedback was invited and given on its format. The usefulness of using pre-Covid comparisons in data was discussed, and it was agreed that it was helpful in terms of passenger numbers, even though the passenger/airline/route mix was now different.
- **Agreed actions:**
 - Forum Chairs and HAAG to share the report with their respective members asking for feedback. All present were also invited to share their thoughts on ways in which to improve the report at any time.
 - Additional elements to be considered for future reports:
 - Pre-covid comparisons
 - Return to growth numbers from Frankfurt and Schiphol as a useful comparator
 - In the interests of transparency, the use of actual air quality figures, as UK legal levels were different to those set by the WHO
 - the inclusion of changing markets data - both demographic and regional



4. Outstanding forum issues introduced by Chairs followed by discussion

- Summary papers from each Chair had been circulated in advance and were taken as read.
- **Local Community Forum:** Roger Green reported that car parking by illegal ‘meet and greet’ firms remained a big issue, particularly in key hot spots, as well as problems caused by HGVs. Whilst some good initiatives had been introduced by HAL, the community would like the airport to take a lead in developing a collective response especially in light of the impending expansion of ULEZ. It was recognised that current legislation was not helpful in enabling local authorities to use new technologies to assist with enforcement. This issue was to be considered further at the HATF Wider Forum in June.
- **Agreed actions:**
 - HAL, with the support of CISHA, to work on collective solutions, to involve all relevant local authorities as well as the airport and, ideally, TfL.
 - Evidence on hotspots and other issues to be gathered ahead of HATF June meeting.
 - CISHA to share the information from UKACCs on how other airports tackled similar problems in relation to parking once available.
- **HATF:** Finding a solution to the Southern Rail Access issue remained a key focus. Arup, who were completing a study of all southern rail options, had undertaken a stress test of their initial findings and an update on this would be brought to the CISHA meeting in July.
- **NACF:** Andreas Lambrianou reported that the airspace modernisation metrics remained a concern to members, as did night flights, which he would raise with John Holland-Kaye later.
- **HAQWG:** The inventory of 2021 emissions was almost complete and a move to annual reporting was anticipated. The UFP monitoring station was being updated today, which would result in better quality data going forward. The process of recruiting an independent chair for the group was progressing and an update would be brought to the CISHA meeting in July.
- **HPF:** The Chair welcomed the chance to hear John Holland-Kaye’s comments on H7 later.

5. Focus subject 1: Heathrow Airport’s Community Noise Insulation and Vortex Repair Schemes – introduction from Rick Norman, Head of Noise Strategy, HAL, followed by discussion

- The airport had offered noise insulation schemes for many decades, with a mixed response in terms of take up, and therefore varying in effect. The most recent Noise Action Plan committed to reviewing these schemes, and the work outlined in the report circulated prior to the meeting was the result of this. The last schemes closed in mid-2022, and in 2023 the outstanding cases were being completed.



- There was not a great deal of research on the efficacy of noise mitigation schemes and HAL had engaged independent experts to look at this.
 - An independent Prioritisation Panel, chaired by the CISHA Chair, was being established to promote transparency of decision making and greater fairness in relation to exceptional cases. In future the airport would cover 100% of the cost, and it was hoped that this would increase take-up levels. They were also working to explore how households could be offered any complementary schemes, such as ventilation, simultaneously in order to minimise disruption. This would include a range of ‘bolt on’ home improvement options, including those offered by local authorities / carbon efficiency schemes / Energy Savings Trust.
 - The complex process of determining areas that would be covered by the schemes was described. Schemes would be implemented gradually zone by zone, and boundaries would necessarily be dynamic as they would be affected by the introduction of quieter aircraft, changes in approaches and any airspace changes.
 - **Agreed actions:**
 - HAL and Prioritisation Panel to develop an effective method of communicating to those in each zone, both in relation to residential and community buildings.
 - HAL and Panel should work closely with local authorities, sharing as much as possible, and allow them to feed into the decision-making process based on their own health and need data. It was agreed that transparency was vital to avoid frustration and annoyance among local residents. This should include updates to Councils as plans progress.
 - CISHA to maintain a watching brief to ensure that the mapping of the zones and the efficacy of the mitigations offered were well evidenced, that the schemes reached those most in need, and that all decisions were clearly explained and reported to Councils and communities.
 - Consideration to be given to providing an annual report on the schemes, both in terms of delivery and outcome, ideally with retrospective data if this were possible.
 - CISHA to share details of the research being undertaken by the DfT on the impact of aircraft noise on sleep and that by the CAA on social attitudes to noise when available.
 - HAL to share outcome of the research being carried out by Southampton University on the impact of aircraft noise on children’s learning in school.
- 6. Focus subject 2: Heathrow 2.0 – update from HAL on sustainability work from Becky Coffin, Director of Sustainability and Communities; and introduction of CISHA scrutiny proposal by CISHA Chair, followed by discussion**
- Becky Coffin summarised the highlights of a presentation on HAL’s sustainability work, to be circulated with the meeting notes. The airport had made good progress on reducing emissions from HAL vehicles, and its 2030 targets to enable it to meet Net Zero by 2050 had been approved by the Science Based Targets initiative. It continued to incentivise airlines to use SAF, and by 2030 over 75% of flights from Heathrow would be



using a minimum of 10% SAF, with the constraining factor to exceeding this being supply.

- Work to increase the number of local SMEs involved in the supply chain, in particular the first tier, was ongoing, as was work to re-develop the sustainable travel zone.
- Ways in which consumers could make well-informed sustainable choices were discussed. The airport had developed a new campaign to communicate the opportunities in the terminals, such as water fountains, new recycling bins and offsetting programmes. From a flight perspective, airlines were investing heavily in SAF, though there was not yet a standard comparative index on the use of SAF to enable passengers to select airlines on this basis – though this was to be addressed as part of the Jet Zero Strategy. The CAA’s Consumer Panel was looking at the extent to which customers made decisions based on sustainability rather than price.
- As part of its remit to monitor Heathrow 2.0, the Chair introduced the air quality scrutiny proposal, circulated with the meeting pack. It recognised that the HAQWG was a technical group with no real community involvement, yet air quality in the local area was a widespread concern amongst residents. The proposal was a three-month project, undertaken with independent experts, to understand the exact nature of these concerns, look at the work being carried out to address them, and to make recommendations based on the findings about how best to give the local community a voice on air quality around the airport.
- **Agreed actions:**
 - CISHA to scope the project and share with members.
 - As road traffic contributed significantly to the air quality issues, the scrutiny project should include a theme around equitable public transport across the local area, particularly given the likely impact of the expansion of ULEZ on the airport workforce.
 - Consideration should be given to the suggestion that TfL should attend CISHA meetings.
 - Mark Frost to share examples of gold-standard modelling scenarios with the Chair.
 - The paper proposed that the project be completed in August and, following concerns raised, the Chair to give thought to whether it would be advisable to continue after the expansion of ULEZ for comparison.
 - HAL’s recently published [Sustainability Report 2022](#) to be included with the meeting notes.
 - All CISHA Members were encouraged to forward any ideas about possible future scrutiny projects.

7. AOB and conclusions

- David Blunkett gave an update on the HLRF, which would now be looking at growth. The Steering Group would be meeting on 3 May to agree the focus and the new name. Skills, employment, and sustainability would be on the agenda, which would be forward looking.



- The Chair advised that the focus subjects for the next meeting would be community funding and HAL's Noise Action Plan, due to be submitted to DEFRA in September. Consideration would also be given to the formal recommendations to be taken to Heathrow's Executive Team in September.
- Mark Frost drew members attention to the HSPGs successful Net Zero Pioneer Places application, funded by Innovate UK. This programme looked to explore 'non-technical' barriers to decarbonising the sub-region, such as a lack of access to funding for carbon reduction projects; insufficient collaboration on transport planning; fragmented management of the electricity grid; and a need to increase the help given residents and businesses to change their behaviour. The bid had a particular focus on how the airport and surrounding communities could work better in partnership. The HSPG had £100k for a three month 'discovery sprint' which started this month. The results from this would form the basis of a phase 2 bid of up to £8m to be submitted in September.

8. Discussions with HAL CEO

- John Holland-Kaye (JHK) joined the meeting for the last thirty minutes. The Chair briefly summarised the discussions that had taken place so far. This was followed by an opportunity to ask questions and raise outstanding issues, including:
 - **Recent CAA decision around H7:** JHK confirmed that, whilst the H7 settlement was less than requested, HAL remained committed to expenditure related to Heathrow 2.0, such as noise mitigation, surface access, and the sustainable travel zone, and to investment in infrastructure, such as the new scanners. The airport was planning to appeal, but this would not impact on day-to-day operations.
 - **Car parking / illegal meet and greet companies / cargo movements on local roads:** JHK agreed that HAL should take the lead and engage with the LCF and HATF to develop a plan to address the issues raised. He recognised that help would be required from local authorities and the Metropolitan Police to ensure that problems were not simply moved to other areas.
 - **Night flights:** JHK monitored night flight figures daily. The data showed an improvement, but resilience and punctuality needed to be improved to reduce late running flights further. He recognised that the local community had been tolerant during recovery and HAL remained committed to minimising both nights with flights and the numbers of late running flights. Work was currently being undertaken to address issues caused by French air traffic control strikes and airlines were supportive of flights being delayed or redirected in such cases, with night flight exceptions being reserved for instances of bad weather, war, etc. It was noted that the DfT would be consulting on night flights later this year.
 - **Ultra-Fine Particles (UFPs):** The issue of UFPs was rising on the local community's agenda as a number of studies on their impact were emerging. SAFs did not release UFPs, and the airport was committed to pushing their use as far as production constraints allowed. JHK was keen to learn more about UFPs and welcomed the focus from CISHA and the forums, and their help in facilitating a coordinated approach and pulling together research.



- **Electric vertical take-off and landing (eVTOL) aircraft and drones:** JHK appreciated the need for an interconnected transport system for local communities and airport users and workers. He had met with a number of related companies and always questioned them about noise, which would be a constraining factor should they wish to fly into Heathrow. The issue of intrusion and the feeling of being overflowed was also raised.
- **Expansion:** JHK confirmed that there was no further update at this stage.
- **Changing operations:** JHK committed to bringing details of any significant anticipated change in operations, such as the introduction of hydrogen or electric flights, to future CISHA meetings to enable the implications to be considered by all stakeholders.
- **Agreed actions:**
 - HAL to collate evidence on illegal parking in time for the HATF meeting in June and have plans in place for the collaborative work to address the issues and implement any enforcement plans in the following two months prior to the expansion of ULEZ.
 - HAL to address the issue of night flights caused by French air traffic control strikes, in partnership with the airlines and the NACF, before the summer peak.
 - Heathrow to research the data on UFPs to determine what within it was airport specific. Cllr Edwards offered to work closely with HAL to achieve more accurate, refined data.
- **CISHA meeting dates in 2023:**
 - 13 July: 1400-1600 Quarterly Meeting
 - 12 October: 1800-2000 Annual Open Forum



<p>CISHA QUARTERLY MEETING 20 APRIL 2023 - SUMMARY OF ACTIONS:</p>
<p>CHAIR’S INTRODUCTION, PREVIOUS MEETING NOTES, OUTSTANDING ACTIONS</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. NACF mapping exercise to be circulated with the meeting notes. 2. HAQWG work plan also to be published on the website.
<p>HAL QUARTERLY REPORT TO CISHA: FORMAT FEEDBACK</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Forum Chairs and HAAG to share the report with their respective members asking for feedback. 4. Further suggestions made in the meeting to be considered.
<p>OUTSTANDING FORUM ISSUES</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. HAL, with the support of CISHA, to work on collective solutions, to involve all relevant local authorities as well as the airport and, ideally, TfL. 6. Evidence on hotspots and other issues to be gathered ahead of HATF June meeting. 7. CISHA to share the information from UKACCs on how other airports tackled similar problems in relation to parking once available.
<p>FOCUS SUBJECT 1: HEATHROW AIRPORT’S COMMUNITY NOISE INSULATION AND VORTEX REPAIR SCHEMES</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 8. HAL and Prioritisation Panel to develop an effective method of communicating to those in each zone, both in relation to residential and community buildings. 9. HAL and Panel should work closely with local authorities, sharing as much as possible, and allow them to feed into the decision-making process based on their own health and need data. It was agreed that transparency was vital to avoid frustration and annoyance among local residents. This should include updates to Councils as plans progress. 10. CISHA to maintain a watching brief to ensure that the mapping of the zones and the efficacy of the mitigations offered were well evidenced, that the schemes reached those most in need, and that all decisions were clearly explained and reported to Councils and communities. 11. Consideration to be given to providing an annual report on the schemes, both in terms of delivery and outcome, ideally with retrospective data if this were possible. 12. CISHA to share details of the research being undertaken by the DfT on the impact of aircraft noise on sleep and that by the CAA on social attitudes to noise when available. 13. HAL to share outcome of the research being carried out by Southampton University on the impact of aircraft noise on children’s learning in school.
<p>FOCUS SUBJECT 2: HEATHROW 2.0</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 14. CISHA to scope the project and share with members. 15. As road traffic contributed significantly to the air quality issues, the scrutiny project should include a theme around equitable public transport across the local area, particularly given the likely impact of the expansion of ULEZ on the airport workforce. 16. Consideration should be given to the suggestion that TfL should attend CISHA meetings. 17. Mark Frost to share examples of gold-standard modelling scenarios with the Chair.



- 18. The paper proposed that the project be completed in August and, following concerns raised, the Chair to give thought to whether it would be advisable to continue after the expansion of ULEZ for comparison.
- 19. HAL’s recently published [Sustainability Report 2022](#) to be included with the meeting notes.
- 20. All CISHA Members were encouraged to forward any ideas about possible future scrutiny projects.

Discussions with HAL CEO

- 21. HAL to collate evidence on illegal parking in time for the HATF meeting in June and have plans in place for the collaborative work to address the issues and implement any enforcement plans in the following two months prior to the expansion of ULEZ.
- 22. HAL to address the issue of night flights caused by French air traffic control strikes, drawn up in partnership with the airlines and the NACF, before the summer peak.
- 23. Heathrow to research the data on UFPs to determine what within it was airport specific. Cllr Edwards offered to work closely with HAL to achieve more accurate, refined data.

CISHA FEBRUARY MEETING 2023 – OUTSTANDING ADDITIONAL ACTIONS:

HATF

- 1. HAL to provide update on ULEZ mitigation when decided.
- 2. CISHA to organise community engagement to communicate Sustainable Travel Zone at an appropriate time.

NACF

- 3. NACF to share forum work plan when agreed.
- 4. CISHA to perform mapping of diversity of forum membership.

HAQWG

- 5. HAQWG to proceed with appointing an independent chair, in consultation with CISHA.